THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at County Hall, Cardiff on 24 September 2015 to transact the business set out in the Council summons dated Friday, 18 September 2015.

Present: County Councillor Walker (Lord Mayor)

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Manzoor Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Ralph Cook, Richard Cook, Cowan, Chris Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Elsmore, Evans, Ford, Goddard, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Graham, Hinchey, Holden, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lloyd, Lomax, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Morgan, Murphy, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Stubbs, Thomas, Ben Thomas, Graham Thomas, Lynda Thorne, Walsh, Weaver, White, Darren Williams and Woodman

## 65 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Councillors Bowden, Davies-Warner, Evans, Goddard, Groves, Parry and Simmons

## 66 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations were made:

| Councillor                                | Item  | Interest  |
|---|---|---|
| Councillor<br>Woodman                     | Item 8 - Audit<br>Committee Annual<br>Report              | Personal Interest as Honorary<br>President of Diverse Cymru that<br>delivers Direct Payments for the<br>Council |
| Councillor<br>Woodman                     | Item 10 – Director of<br>Social Services<br>Annual report | Personal Interest in National<br>Adoption Service as Family<br>member is a Manager in the<br>Service.           |
| Chief Executive<br>and Senior<br>Officers | Item 13 – Notice of<br>Motion                             | Prejudicial interest in notice of<br>Motion on Senior Management<br>Structure                                   |

## 67 : MINUTES

The minutes of the Council meeting 23 July 2015 were approved as a correct record subject to the following minor amendments: -

Page 88: Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman* in the penultimate paragraph the addition of the word *'badly'* after treated.

Page 96: Question from *County Councillor Dianne Rees* – top of the page replace as Question from *County Councillor Stubbs* 

The following Question from *County Councillor Dianne Rees* –replace as *Supplementary Question from County Councillor Stubbs* 

Page 97: Supplementary Question from *County Councillor Dianne Rees* – top of the page replace as Question from *County Councillor Hudson* and correction of typographical error in the last sentence maters to *'matters'* 

## 68 : LORD MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The Lord Mayor made the following announcements at the meeting: -

(1) Eid Mubarak

The Lord Mayor in recognition of the Holy Day of Eid-UI-Adha in the Muslim calendar wished all Muslim citizens of Cardiff and around the world celebrating "Eid Mubarak".

(2) <u>Welcome</u>

A warm welcome was extended to the Chair of the Audit Committee Mr Ian Arundale. Mr Arundale had taken over the reins of the Audit Committee from Sir Jon Shortridge who has stood down from the Committee at its last meeting.

The Lord Mayor on behalf of the Council, and as a former Member of the Audit Committee, thanked Sir Jon Shortridge most sincerely for his commitment and professionalism in Chairing the Audit Panel which from July 2009 became the Audit Committee under the new Welsh Measure. His expertise and knowledge has been invaluable to the Committee and the Council and we wish him all the very best for the future.

(3) <u>Condolences</u>

It was with great sadness that Members learned that Councillor Elaine Simmons's husband Rob passed away in early August. The Lord Mayor on behalf of the Council had sent a letter of sincere condolences to Elaine and her family.

### (4) <u>Congratulations</u>

The Lord Mayor congratulated Councillor Kirsty Warner-Davies on the birth on 15 September, 2015 of her son Vincent Morgan we wish them both well.

Congratulations were also given to Councillor Jim Murphy who had become a great-grandfather following the birth of his grandson George, Elliot.

### (5) <u>Recognition and Awards</u>

### (i) <u>Time Credit Scheme</u>

The Council has teamed up with Spice Innovations to create meaningful change in communities across the city with the Time Credit scheme, which rewards individuals for every hour of their time they give to local service and groups.

The scheme has been working in Cardiff for a number of years, within the Communities First clusters and third sector organisations. One Time Credit is earned for each hour of time a person gives to a particular initiative and can be spent on events, training and leisure activities provided by public, community and private organisations, or to thank others in turn.

The Time credits model has already proved successful for individuals and communities in the areas of Cardiff where it has been available with 37 per cent of people involved gaining some work experience and 11 per cent gaining employment because of time credits while 43 per cent felt less isolated and 32 per cent had less need to go to the doctor.

The Time Credits scheme is now being extended through the Families First programme and the Council's Youth Service, which means that it can now be accessed by individuals and communities right across Cardiff. .

(ii) <u>Congratulations to Llysfaen Primary School</u> who have been awarded the prestigious NACE Cymru Challenge Award for More Able and Talented Pupils!

The Award is given for high quality work by the whole school, teachers and governors, in challenging all pupils, including those with high abilities, to achieve their best.

The Award is given when schools demonstrate that they meet the criteria of the Award and will remain committed to continuing to ensure high-quality provision for more able and talented pupils.

I am looking forward to presenting the award certificate to the school on Wednesday 30<sup>th</sup> September.

(iii) <u>Glamorgan Archives</u>

Well done to the team over in Glamorgan Archives. They have completed a three year Investors in People review and continue to maintain accreditation as Investors in People organisation with Bronze status.

The review report describes the team as 'a resilient organisation with a robust approach to service delivery through a highly committed and motivated team'.

(iv) <u>City of Cardiff Education Catering</u>

Congratulations to the Council's Education Catering, who have been shortlisted for the following awards.

Fitzalan High School Catering Team have been shortlisted for the Secondary School Catering Team of the Year at the Educatering Awards which are being held on 13 October 2015

The Summer Holiday Enrichment Programme which was led by Education Catering and Cardiff and Vale University Health Board (Public Health Team and Public Health Dieticians) under Food Cardiff has been shortlisted for the Sustainable Public Sector Award at the Sustain Wales Awards on the 19<sup>th</sup> November.

### 6. Rugby World Cup 2015

Cardiff is once again welcoming World Rugby to the City. We are delighted to be host city for some of the Group A pool matches, and two of the Quarter Finals. This is another opportunity for Wales and Cardiff to be profiled on the international stage.

We of course wish the Welsh Rugby team every success in the competition and in particular in their crucial match against our English rivals on Saturday.

### (7) Lord Mayor Charity: - Cardiff United Against Cancer Appeal

Cardiff United Against Cancer was launched on 10 September 2015. The Lord Mayor expressed his gratitude to the Media Wales who gave it front page status, and have indicated that they intend to support and report on the charity appeal throughout the Mayoral year.

The three Student Union Presidents from Cardiff Universities have also accepted the challenge to support fundraising for Velindre.

The Lord Mayor appreciated the fundraising efforts from Councillors with Councillor Dianne Rees arranged an Italian lunch Extravaganza and the Deputy Lord Mayor is organising a Charity Gala Dinner on 11 November 2015 at City Hall. Details of which and booking arrangement have been circulated around the Chamber today. It was good that everyone works together on the Cardiff United against Cancer campaign.

In addition the Lord Mayor was delighted to report that schools in Cardiff had pledged to support the Christmas i- Can challenge for Cardiff United Against Cancer charity appeal. The idea will be for schools to develop their entrepreneurial skills whilst raising money for their schools and for Velindre Cancer Centre.

The aim is for a £10 loan to be given to the pupils and they will have five weeks to grow that into a larger sum. Many schools have Christmas fetes so we thought this would be a wonderful opportunity for children to raise funds. Schools participating keep a small proportion of funds raised and the rest will go to the Lord Mayor's Charity.

Many Councillors are School Governors. The Lord Mayor therefore asked them to encourage schools to participate in this challenge. In recognition of this fund raising challenge the Lord Mayor advised that he would present certificates to all who take part and that he will invite some of the i-Can participants to the Mansion House.

Further details of all fund raising events and initiatives will be circulated to Members in a briefing shortly.

69 : NOTICE OF VACANCY

The Council was informed of the notice of vacancy in the Office of Councillor for the Electoral Division of Riverside following resignation of Councillor Cecilia Love received on 21 August 2015.

Councillors Darren Williams on behalf of her ward colleagues thanked Councillor Love for her hard work and passion in representing the residents of Riverside and wished her all the best for the future.

RESOLVED – That the vacancy in the Office of Councillor for Electoral Division of Riverside and that a By-Election had been arranged for 7 October 2015 be noted.

70 : PETITIONS

The following petition were received:-

- <u>Councillor Marshall</u> 865 signatures calling on the Council to save our Sports Hall and library to ensure the health & well-being of the people of Splott, Tremorfa, Adamsdown and Roath.
- <u>Councillor Cowan</u> 185 signatures e-petition (still open) calling on Cardiff Council to reinstate a school crossing patrol person on Heol Llanishen Fach, which services Llanishen Fach Primary School. It is a large, busy primary school which is situated on a busy road;
- 3. <u>Councillor Cowan</u> 140 signatures calling on the Council to keep Wedal Road Household Recycling Centre open to residents of Cardiff North.
- 4. <u>Councillor Sanders</u> 1000+ residents requesting that the Council have a Zebra crossing/ or a Pedestrian Traffic Light Crossing installed on Heol Llanishen Fach where the brook goes under the road as it is a busy crossing point for people going to and from the bus stop.
- <u>Councillor Hill-John</u> 1200+ signatures calling on the Council to refuse planning permission for an extension to the south east of the quarry and protect woodlands;
- 6. <u>Councillor Holden</u> 1811 signatures and e-petition calling on the Council to retain a recycling facility on Wedal Road;

- 6
- <u>Councillor Dianne Rees</u> 300 signatures and e-petition calling on the Council to make safe by implementing road safety measures on Heol Pontprennau between its junctions with Heol Glandulais an Clos Nant Glaswg.

## 71 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

The Council was advised that two public questions had been received. However question 2 from Mrs J Gasson would fall as she was unable to attend the Council meeting.

### Question: from Mrs Jean Evans

Will the Council finally condemn the pulling of the football exhibition showing Arab Israeli co operation from the Library. The decision to do so received world wide condemnation and brings Cardiff into disrepute. This is not the first time this has occurred. Can the Council give any assurance that such insults to our diverse community will not occur again?

## <u>Reply</u>: from County Councillor Bradbury

The decisions surrounding the staging and withdrawal of the "Low Football: Jewish-Arab Football: Diversity and Co-existence" exhibition in Cardiff Central Library Hub have caused a wide range of concerns, distress and anger to be expressed to Cardiff Council.

Senior Officers of the Council have met with Faith Leaders and have apologised for any offence caused as a result of the decisions that were made operationally relating to the exhibition. The council has a legal responsibility to promote good community relations and I sincerely regret that on this occasion the Council's actions have led to accusations of bias and partiality with understandable anger being expressed as a result.

The lack of a clear decision making framework for the display, promotion and communication of materials proposed for free exhibition in our publicly accessible library buildings by any group or organisation has become apparent as a result of this very regrettable case.

A key issue for me is that it would appear that there are no current consultation processes in place that would help to ensure properly informed decisions are made by library staff in respect of possible community impacts.

In order to make sure that we get things right in the future and learn from this very regrettable event I am keen to include the views of as wide a range of community and faith group representatives as possible. I have asked the Director of Communities, Housing and Customer Services to review our processes in consultation with the Interfaith group of community leaders and to make recommendations to Cabinet to ensure that we learn from this situation and ensure that the Council does not, albeit inadvertently, cause distress and anger to any community group in the future as a result of the use of its public space.

## Supplementary Question: from Mrs Jean Evans

I still find it hard to understand how offence could be caused by something promoting co-existence. Is there not a possibility of appointing a well-informed Councillor, an unbiased person, as a diversity officer to avoid this happening?

## Reply: from County Councillor Bradbury

The question you ask is a little bit above my paygrade. All I can say- it's the Leader of the Council. I don't employ diversity champions.

To be honest, I can see where you're coming from but the point for me is that we fundamentally got the process wrong. And we have to get in place a process that ensures that we get these things right and that we do not cause offence to any groups – any community or faith groups – based on my experience of this exhibition.

As I stated to you outside, I'm happy to talk to any groups who are willing to engage in this process. And, once again, I express my regret and sorrow for any offence that has been caused on this issue.

### 72 : STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS 2014/15 AND ANNUAL COMPLIANCE REPORTS

The Council was recommended to approve the audited Statement of Accounts for the year ending 31 March 2015; to note the reports of the Wales Audit Office on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff Council, Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund and Cardiff Port Health Authority for the year ending 31 March 2015; to note the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2014/15; and to note that formal documents will be signed at the conclusion of the meeting prior to 30 September 2015.

The International Standard on Auditing (ISA) 260 requires the Appointed Auditor to report to those charged with governance, on the key matters arising from the audit examination of the Statement of Accounts for the year ending 31 March 20135

In accordance with the Council's Treasury Management Policy Statement, the Annual Treasury Management Report for 2014/15 is presented based on the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) Code of Practice.

The Cabinet Member, Corporate Services & Performance introduced the report and commended the recommendations to Council. This was seconded by Councillor Hunt.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report during which the following key issues were raised

- School balances how the Council is working with schools to reduce deficits; and
- Prosiect Gwyrdd a matter raised around the overspend and contract subsidies as identified in the accounts.

## **RESOLVED – That**

- the audited Statement of Accounts for the year ended 31 March 2015 (Appendix 1) duly certified and re-certified by the Section 151 Officer be noted;
- 2. the audited Statement of Accounts for the ended 31 March 2015 (Appendix 1), be approved and signed and dated by the Chair of Council on behalf of the Council
- 3. the Section 151 Officer be instructed to arrange for publication of the Statement of Accounts and all associated requirements.
- 4. the reports of the Wales Audit Office on the Statement of Accounts of Cardiff Council, Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund, Cardiff Port Health Authority and Cardiff Harbour Authority for the year ending 31 March 2015 (Appendices 3, 5, 6 and 7) be noted
- 5. the final Letter of Representation for Cardiff Council (Appendix 4) be noted.
- 6. the Treasury Management Annual Report for 2014/15 (Appendix 8) be noted.
- 7. the following documents areformally signed at the conclusion of the meeting:
  - Statement of Accounts for Cardiff Council including the Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Lord Mayor and Corporate Director Resources
  - Annual Governance Statement (within the accounts) Leader of the Council and Chief Executive
  - Annual Return of Cardiff Port Health Authority Corporate Director Resources
  - Statement of Accounts for Cardiff Harbour Authority Corporate Director Resources
  - Letters of Representation for Cardiff Council, Cardiff Port Health Authority – Leader of the Council and Corporate Director Resources
  - Letter of Representation for Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Pension Fund – Leader of the Council and Corporate Director Resources
  - Audit Certificate for Cardiff Council and Cardiff Port Health Authority Appointed Auditor, Wales Audit Office. To be signed at a later date.

## 73 : AUDIT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2014/15

### (Councillor Woodman declared a personal interest under the Member Code of Conduct in this item. She remained at the meeting during consideration of this item)

Mr Ian Arundale, Chair of the Audit Committee from June 2015 introduced the Committee's Annual Report. He thanked Sir Jon Shortridge for leading the Committee and providing a focus over the last three years. The Committee had actively engaged with Senior Officers and had received the professional support from officers from Internal Audit, External Audit (Wales Audit Office), Finance and Treasury Management. Both

independent and Committee Members had contributed and robustly scrutinised both standard and specific items over 5 meeting in 2014/15.

The Committee within its terms of reference focussed on key risks and challenges faced by the Authority over the past 12 months. The Organisational Development Plan is intrinsically linked to these risks and challenges, and in order to obtain assurances on its delivery the Committee in December was very pleased to receive a presentation by the Leader and the Chief Executive; as well

updates on key items for example the budget and internal audits and areas of concern raised by Members from audit reports.

At each meeting the work programme was been reviewed to include new matters identified and all Members were encouraged to bring any concerns they have forward so that agendas could be set taking account of changing risks and priorities.

Within the remit of the Committee, it has sought to receive a satisfactory level of assurance on specific matters to support its consideration of the Council's Annual Governance Statement 2014/15.

The Committee undertook a Self-Assessment exercise in January, and it will look to improve agenda management; prioritise the key issues and improve on and look to add value through its work.

The Committee will continue to give advice on financial pressures facing the Council, and look to strengthen its work and support.

The Lord Mayor thanked the Chair for the Audit Committee Annual report and invited comments and questions from Members. The following matters were raised: -

- School budget continuing deficits;
- Concerns about directorate overspends in particular Adult & Children's Services;
- A Committee Member recommended Self Evaluation process to other Committees;
- The need to investigate the procurement of new bins as part of the new waste strategy roll out;
- Continuing concerns around procurement and contract management process;
- Significant concerns with audit report compliance issues

### RESOLVED – That

- (1) the Annual Audit Committee Annual report for 2014/15 and forward plan for 2015/16 be notes;
- (2) the issues raised be considered for further investigation and inclusion in the 2015/16 Work plan.

### 74 : NOTICE OF MOTION

(Chief Executive and Senior Officers declared a prejudicial interest in this Notice of Motion and left the meeting during consideration of this item.)

The Lord Mayor advised that one notice of motion had been submitted and was included on the Summons for the meeting. No amendments had been received.

The Notice of Motion was proposed by Councillor McEvoy and seconded by Councillor Holden as follows:

- This Council believes that Cardiff Council senior management is top heavy and does not provide value for money.
- This Council agrees to restructure the senior management at above OM 1 level in keeping with employment law, with a view to saving over £1 million a year.
- This Council will restructure at OM 1 and OM 2 level, with a view to deleting vacant posts only This Council will consult with trade unions and staff and set a maximum rate payable to any consultants used by the Council.

The Lord Mayor invited debate. Following the debate a vote on the Motion taken.

The vote LOST.

## 75 : DIRECTOR OF SOCIAL SERVICES ANNUAL REPORT 2014/15

(Councillor Woodman declared a personal interest under the Member Code of Conduct in this item. She remained at the meeting during consideration of this item)

The Council received the Annual Report of the Director of Social Services for 2014-15 as part of its responsibilities under the Welsh Government Statutory Guidance on the Role and Accountabilities of the Director of Social Services.

The Deputy Leader, as the Cabinet Member Early Years, Children & Families presented the sixth annual report of the Director of Social Services. The report continued to build on improvements made in the previous 12 months particularly in focussing on a transparent overall assessment of performance; quality of service delivery, and the underlying strengths and weaknesses of social services in Cardiff; and what needs to be done to improve further in terms of supporting the most vulnerable people in the city.

The report provided an insight into a very wide range of highly specialised services balanced against the key strategic challenges facing the Council in meeting client's complex needs and significant demographic and demand pressures. Added to these pressures currently and in the future are legislature changes in relation to the Social Services and Wellbeing Act (2014).

The report identifies a stronger narrative on the strategic agenda and the role of the organisational development programme in terms of accelerating change and improvement, however next year – following feedback from colleagues and Members in Scrutiny- the report will focus more clearly on setting out progress and performance against citizen outcomes.

The Cabinet Member was reassured by a recent evaluation and feedback from the Care and Social Services Inspectorate for Wales (CSSIW) which has confirmed that although, quote "some key areas of performance still require improvement, the Council is moving in the right direction." Further quote, "the Director's report presents a clear picture of the challenges and areas of progress made within the directorate over the past year. Also, clear aims are set for delivering improvements over the coming year." These comments endorse the steps that have been taken to improve Social Services, and provide a level of confidence going forward.

The Cabinet Member commended the report and Councillor Elsmore, Cabinet Member Health, Housing & Wellbeing seconded the report.

The Lord Mayor invited debate from which the following questions and observations were raised for response: -

- the number of children in B&B accommodation in the city;
- use of Third Sector support to support the delivery of quality services;
- concerns around performance; targets and the need to benchmark;
- poor Performance indicators resulting in the Council failing vulnerable children & adults;
- note the improvements and initiatives being taken to recruit and retain social workers;
- concern around the use of agency staff; loyalty to the service; levels of turnover staff and sickness;
- the need for workforce planning; the development of skills; loss of talent and business intelligence;
- concerns arising from the Employee Survey and low morale; and staff communications;
- Members were keen to hear more about the service delivery model; and collaboration;
- recognition of increases in demand for services from those most vulnerable in society;
- concerns around initial assessments and Child Protection reviews; care Plans; and Social Worker vacancies;
- it was recognised that Community and Adult Services Scrutiny Committee challenges and probes the Cabinet Member and Director.

The Cabinet Member Health, Housing & Wellbeing advised that the service was benefitting from Challenge Forum opportunities and outcomes and was making significant progress in improvement in budget management and ensuring greater controls

RESLOVED – That the Council received and noted the Annual Report of the Director of Social Services for 2014-15.

## 76 : SCHEME TO SUPPORT THE RESETTLEMENT OF AFGHAN AND SYRIAN INDIVIDUALS AND FAMILIES IN THE UK

The Lord Mayor advised that this report provided details of the Home Office Syrian Vulnerable Persons Scheme and the scheme for the resettlement of Afghan

nationals proposed by the Cabinet with a view to the Council supporting the implementation of the schemes. The Cabinet Member Health, Housing & Wellbeing, Councillor Elsmore proposed the report which was seconded by the Deputy Leader, Cabinet Member for Early Years, Children & Families, Councillor Lent.

The Lord Mayor advised that an amendment to the recommendation in the report had been proposed by Councillor Bridges and seconded by Councillor Margaret Jones.

Councillor Elsmore presented the report. She indicated that she opposed the amendment. She indicated that she was committed to keeping Elected Members fully informed as matters progress by way of Cabinet statement.

The report outlined the principals of the UK schemes to relocate Syrian vulnerable persons and resettle Afghan individuals and families. The Cabinet Member advised of work with partners to develop an approach to this crisis to ensure a structure is in place that partnership arrangements are solid and that a leadership group is in place to work on a regional basis

The Council's experience of years of successful resettlement has set the Council in good stance to plan to meet the educational, accommodation, health, and community-support needs of those we welcome. The recent escalation of the problem and the announcement of the change in scale of the United Kingdom response has meant that it is right and proper that the Council takes this decision to confirm its involvement in the schemes.

The Lord Mayor invited debate and Members unanimously supported the Cabinet's proposal.

RESOLVED – That Council supports the implementation of the scheme as approved by the Cabinet on 17 September 2015 to: -

- (1) in principle to enter into the Home Office's Syrian Vulnerable Persons Scheme;
- (2) in principle to enter into the Home Office's scheme for the resettlement of Afghan nationals that have supported the British Armed Forces in the Afghanistan conflict;
- (3) a multi agency leadership group has been established to oversee the preparations for regional participation in the scheme comprising Members and Officers of the City of Cardiff Council, the Vale of Glamorgan Council, Cardiff University Health Board and Third Sector and Faith group representatives;
- (4) authority be delegated to the Director of Communities, Housing and Customer Services in consultation with the Cabinet Member for Health, Housing and Wellbeing to progress the detail of the Authorities involvement in the scheme.
- 77 : LEADER AND CABINET MEMBER STATEMENTS

The following Statements were received from the Leader and Cabinet Members.

1. Leader Statement (Economic Development & Partnerships)

### Core Cities Visit

On the one year anniversary of the Scottish independence referendum, the Core Cities held their first Cabinet meeting in Cardiff. The Core Cities are ten of the UK's largest cities outside London, are home to 18 million people and generate around 25% of the UK's wealth. It was a great opportunity for the Welsh capital to host the Leaders or Mayors of the major UK cities and experience Cardiff on the eve of hosting some major Rugby World Cup matches.

In September 2014, Cardiff and Glasgow became the first cities outside of England to join the network. As a Group, the Core Cities advocate the devolution of powers to cities to create more jobs, deliver effective services and make an even greater contribution to the national economy. Cardiff is more than playing its part. Two out of every three net new jobs in South East Wales were created in Cardiff over recent years and the city is projected to be the fastest growing major city in Britain over the next 15 years – a reflection on how desirable a place it is to live and work. Despite this, compared to other European cities like Munich and Barcelona, Cardiff and the other core cities are underperforming.

As members of the Core Cities, Cardiff has an opportunity to address this. Working with Welsh Government, Cardiff is uniquely placed to make use of the flexibilities of Welsh devolution and the lessons learnt from other UK cities to deliver on behalf of the wider city region and for Wales as a whole. The Core Cities Cabinet was also addressed by the Minister for Finance and Government Business who outlined the benefits of Welsh devolution. It was also an important opportunity to learn from the cities that have successfully negotiated and delivered City Deals in other areas of the UK, and who are currently negotiating further devolution and/or city deals.

The Core Cities also held interesting discussions with representatives from the Arts Councils of Wales, England and Scotland on how the arts can contribute to public service reform and social and economic inclusion. Over the next 12 months the Core Cities have agreed to do a major piece of work on economic inclusion that will help shape the national agenda on this issue.

## City Deal and Great Western Cities Submission to HM Treasury

The Cardiff Capital Region has now provided an initial submission for a City Deal to Her Majesty's Treasury ahead of the 4<sup>th</sup> of September deadline, following agreement by the Leaders of the ten local authorities of South East Wales. It confirms a collective commitment to negotiating a City Deal.

The Cardiff Capital Region (CCR) City Deal is being developed in time for the UK Government's March 2016 Budget and will require a period of intense work through the rest of this calendar year in order to inform the Spending Review and Autumn Statement. The next steps will involve a detailed programme of stakeholder engagement to develop the City Deal further. Though the timescales will be challenging, this represents an important opportunity for the region.

Cardiff, Bristol and Newport have also provided a submission to Her Majesty's Treasury about how the Great Western Cities (GWC) can help grow the wider economy of the Western region and rebalance jobs and prosperity across the UK.

The Great Western Cities are in one of the six 'powerhouse super-city-regions' that were identified by the RSA's City Growth Commission as being fundamental to powering the British economy over the coming decades. The GWC investment proposition and the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal are independent but entirely complimentary developments. Both the Bristol City Region and the Cardiff Capital Region are in the process of developing city deals to further enhance regional prosperity. The GWC proposal will enhance local opportunities by better connecting two successful city regions. The proposal focuses on investment into national connectivity, energy infrastructure and better marketing the region to global businesses. This autumn a report will be launched which sets out the strategic economic case for the Great Western Cities, alongside the investment propositions for the key projects.

## China Trade Visit

Following a private visit to Xiamen in August 2014, during which I met the Mayor of Xiamen and agreed to explore new ways to develop the long standing friendship between our cities, I was invited to attend the China International Fair for Investment and Trade (CIFIT) in Xiamen earlier this month. CIFIT is currently China's only international investment promotion event aimed at facilitating two-way investment in participating countries.

These links are increasingly important as platforms for more mutual trade, investment and research opportunities. Large and growing markets for Welsh goods and services, like China, therefore offer real economic benefits to the wider Cardiff Capital Region and can support jobs.

It provided an excellent opportunity to meet with investors, promote Cardiff and the wider Cardiff Capital Region, and help build connections with businesses in one of the world's biggest economies. It also helped further cement the twin city ties between Cardiff and Xiamen.

# Cardiff Business Awards

On the 18<sup>th</sup> of September I addressed over 400 attendees present at the inaugural Cardiff Business Council Awards at City Hall. It was an opportunity to celebrate the best of the capital city's business and the huge contribution that our city's entrepreneurs make to Cardiff. From successful pop-up food events, to outdoor cinemas, new music festivals and unique retail offerings – entrepreneurs help make Cardiff one of Europe's most liveable cities. The nominees for the awards were all testament to this.

Cardiff's economy is also growing, with business start-up rates in the city having increased considerably in recent years. The Capital is now home to a strong small business sector, international companies, top universities, and has a skilled workforce. These are the building blocks of success which will be supported by

investment in the infrastructure and environment that supports business. The Cardiff Business Awards provided an opportunity to hear about how businesses see the future of the city, as well as celebrate their contribution to life in Cardiff.

## Cardiff's Central Square regeneration

Legal & General have invested £400m in Cardiff's Central Square Regeneration scheme. This represents the single biggest private investment for over a decade in Cardiff and the biggest property deal ever seen in Wales. The investment will support the redevelopment of one million square foot of land – transforming the area around the city's train station into a thriving business district. The redevelopment of this part of the city is a key priority for the administration.

There is no doubt that the City Council has to look at innovative ways to deliver vital projects and this is an excellent example. The redevelopment of Central Square will be overseen by Foster and Partners, award winning British architects who have an innovative, modern and sustainable approach to architecture and integrated design. The development will therefore not only significantly improve the landscape of Cardiff for those arriving from Central Station, it will also deliver growth and investment, bringing approximately 10,000 jobs to the area in the heart of Cardiff's Enterprise Zone.

This major commitment from Legal & General provides new impetus for the delivery of the Central Square regeneration scheme, having agreed to support the Central Square redevelopment. This will include the proposed new BBC Headquarters building which is set to receive final approval to proceed in October. Legal & General's decision is a major vote of confidence in Rightacres, and the City of Cardiff, where they employ around 1100 people. Whilst the investment deal stands on its own merits, Cardiff is now well known to Legal & General, and in an increasingly competitive city-regional investment market. It is clear that the city is now well established as a location for blue-chip investment.

The Leader responded to questions on his statement relating to the Cardiff Business Council; Business rates; City deal and collaboration with regional Local Authorities and the Great Western Cities partners.

# 2. <u>Corporate Services and Performance Statement</u>

# Employee Engagement

- Over 3,200 employees took part in this year's Employee Survey, a full 1000 more employees than in 2013, which represents a 51.6% return rate. In addition, almost one thousand comments and ideas were submitted by staff as part of the survey process, which will provide valuable detail to feed into new corporate initiatives. Next steps include further staff roadshows in November to look at commitments in response to the findings.
- The e-learning Attendance & Wellbeing module was launched as part of the compliance for all managers for completion by no later than 31 October. Consultation has commenced on proposed changes to the Disciplinary Policy in order to ensure the process is managed as efficiently as possible.

• The Cardiff Manager programme is progressing with some 350 managers from Grades 7 to 10 enrolled across the Council.

## Digital Cardiff

- Following the expansion of C2C opening hours and a review of the working practice, the peaks in demand have little impact on the performance to customers. This is seen in 11,840 Waste Management cases last month which is a 27.7% increase from this time last year and comes as a result of the completion of phase 1 of the Waste Restrictions programme. Despite this increase, calls to the Waste and Highways line were answered within an average of 15 seconds.
- Customer Satisfaction remains high within C2C 153 telephone surveys were completed in August, resulting in an actual satisfaction rate of 99% and 20 surveys were also carried out through the medium of Welsh and resulted in a Satisfaction rate of 100%.
- In August customers spent an average of 2 minutes 19 seconds on the website during which time they viewed an average of 2.65pages. These statistics continue to support feedback from the latest Ask Cardiff Survey and SOCITM report that indicates customers are able to quickly find the information they want on our website.
- The Council's free Wi-Fi super connected cities project has been very successful with residents and visitors using the service for over 4.5 million minutes every month.

## New ICT Schools Service Level Agreement

A revamped ICT Schools SLA is now in place offering schools more information about the services they might wish to subscribe to from ICT. There has been a very good take up with many asking for more services than previously. There are teething problems where some schools have failed to read the options and have neglected to sign for services they require and we are working with these schools on options.

## ICT Apprentices / Work Experience

This year ICT have employed their first two apprentices. One has recently been appointed to a permanent role which is very pleasing for both the individual and the council. ICT is also providing work experience for an individual under the Looked After Children (LAC) work experience initiative.

## Blaenau Gwent CRM contract

From 1<sup>st</sup> October we will no longer provide CRM services to Blaenau Gwent as their ICT is now being provided by the Shared Resources Service in Blaenavon. This brings an end to a very successful co-operative working arrangement that has been in place for the last 6 years.

## Strategic Estates

- Good progress continues to be made with improving the way the Council manages its property assets.
- Following the approval and publication of the Corporate Property Strategy and the Corporate Asset Management Plan earlier this year, we are starting to see a more joined-up corporate approach across the Council. New Service Area asset plans and Neighbourhood Area asset plans are being put into place.
- The Asset Management Board now meets monthly with a view to ensuring the Council targets to rationalise and modernise the estate are delivered and to improve collaboration with local partners.
- The office rationalisation programme is also working towards several key moves including the vacation and possible assignment of Global Link, whilst more staff continue to be relocated within County Hall. We have also initiated significant work around other buildings occupied by staff, such as depots, in advance of considering alternative delivery model proposals.
- Good progress has been made with CATs at Pentrebane and Maesycoed Community Centre, and further CATs are being prepared including the impending advertisement of Roath Library and Canton Community Hall.
- A new strategy for the management of the Council's investment estate will be presented to Cabinet for consideration prior to Christmas

## Resources

- The Financial Statements for 2014/15 have now been audited and appear on the agenda for approval. The accounts are unqualified and the Audit Committee complemented officers on the successful outcome of a complex set of tasks.
- Budget preparation for 2016/17 and the medium term is progressing with the intention of public consultation commencing during November.

The Cabinet Member responded to questions on his statement relating to the Connect to Cardiff performance; Canton Community Hall; Alternative Delivery Models and partnership with Tarde Unions; Collaborative Working; employee Survey and matters around improvements to staff health and wellbeing.

3. Education Statement

Improving educational opportunities for our City's children is one of our corporate priorities. It is vital for the economic prosperity of the city and for the life chances of our children.

The results for the 2014-2015 academic year build on last year's improvements. The actions we have put in place to address longstanding shortcomings in provision are now having a positive impact on improving outcomes for learners. Standards of attainment continue to improve in all key stages and in many indicators at a faster rate than across Wales as a whole although outcomes at the end of each key stage are not yet high enough.

In the Foundation Phase and Key Stage 2 the rate of improvement has increased in Cardiff in each of the past three years, whilst across Wales the rate of improvement

has slowed. Cardiff is now at least in line with the national average in all the main indicators in the primary phase.

At Key Stage 3 performance is still improving albeit the rate of improvement has slowed. At Key Stage 4, outcomes improved in nearly all the main indicators. In the level 2+ threshold Cardiff's performance increase rose again, making a 9 percentage point (ppt) improvement over the last two years; in 2011 8 schools fewer than 40% of their pupils achieved level 2+, now only 2. Whilst there has also been improvement in the wider level 2 measure, the rate of improvement on this and the currently available data on the level 1 measure are of continuing concern in a number of secondary schools.

An increasing number of pupils of all ages attain the highest levels at each key stage. Girls continue to outperform boys at all key stages, but the gap in performance has reduced in Key Stage 2 and Key Stage 3. The difference in performance of pupils who are eligible for free school meals and those not eligible is reducing at each key stage.

The improvement is not consistent across the board so there is no room for complacency. We will continue to work with the consortium and schools to lift standards further. There is increasing partnership work between schools to enable best practice to be shared but as a Local Authority we have shown that we are prepared to intervene where there is continuing concern about standards.

Some schools have had particularly good results this year. Amongst Secondary schools Fitzalan achieved above 50% on level 2+, Cardiff high and Corpus maintaining high standards and a big rise in Radyr and Whitchurch High Schools. Two Primary schools, St Joseph's RC and St Mellons achieved 100% in both FPOI and CSI. Many primary schools achieved big improvements in the number of children reaching the FPOI: Bryn Celyn Primary, Pentrebane Primary and St Fagans Church in Wales Schools all achieved more than a 20ppt improvement.

The Cabinet Member wished to congratulate staff and pupils on the results this summer and thank them for their work. Without the efforts of teachers none of this improvement could have taken place.

Members commended the Cabinet Member and her predecessor on the progress being made in standards in Cardiff Schools and the positive results in the Summer. The Cabinet Member responded to comments made on the Estyn inspection; differences in attainment between girls and boys. The Cabinet Member undertook to provide an update for Members in her statement on the attainment of Local after Children.

## 4. Skills, Safety & Engagement Statement

### **Questions to Scrutiny**

In October the Council's five scrutiny committees will introduce arrangements for citizens to directly ask questions at their meetings. This measure, one of the first changes stemming from the Council's recently adopted *Improving Scrutiny* Project, is

18

designed to increase citizen involvement with local democracy. It aims to fulfil a recommendation from the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee's *Public Engagement with Scrutiny* Inquiry.

An initial pilot in October and November, arranged in partnership with Cardiff Third Sector Council, will see third sector organisations asking one question at each scrutiny meeting. The pilot will be evaluated with a view to making this an ongoing feature of scrutiny committee agendas.

## Strategic Equality Scheme 2016-20

The Council is required under the Equality Act 2010 to publish every four years a Strategic Equality Plan, setting out its medium term equality objectives, and how through delivering these objectives the Council will work to eliminate discrimination, promote equality and promote good relations between different groups.

Various local stakeholders and individual citizens will be invited to contribute their views on draft Plan, which will be published in October. From the feedback received, a final Plan will be published in April 2014. The Plan will reinforce a number of related initiatives, including the recently adopted Ageing Well Delivery Plan

Members of Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee will consider the draft Plan in October and provided their structured feedback, but more generally Members of this Council will be warmly invited to provide individual feedback on the draft Plan.

## Artist In Residence

The Council has been asked to participate in an Artist in Residence Programme led by "Made in Roath" taking place across Cardiff this Autumn.

Artist-in-residence programmes exist to invite artists, academicians, curators, and all manner of creative people for a time and space away from their usual environment and obligations. They provide a time of reflection, research, presentation and/or production. They also allow an individual to explore his/her practice within another community; meeting new people, using new materials, experiencing life in a new location. Art residencies emphasize the importance of meaningful and multi-layered cultural exchange and immersion into another culture.

They have proposed a Public Democracy project at no cost to the council which would invoke a local artist observing committee and council meetings. More detail will follow but I encourage members to support this initiative as part our public engagement work across the council.

The Cabinet Member responded to comments made in relation to the positive engagement with scrutiny with the introduction of public questions and matters around the protocol for exhibitions in Council venues.

## 5. <u>Environment Statement</u>

### Cardiff Allotments Service – Local Management Agreement

Over the past 12 months Officers and the Member Champion for Community and Food Growing have been working closely with Allotment Communities to revise the Allotment Local Management agreement, through a review designed to encourage more Site Associations to enter into local management agreements. The review has resulted in the provision of three levels of agreement tailored to meet the capacity and expertise within individual Site Associations. A grant payable is based on a percentage of site income from the previous year and reflects the level responsibility adopted by the Site Associations have entered into an agreement and two have indicated that they wish to enter into an agreement from April 2016 bringing the total to twelve of twenty eight Site Associations. The process of involving the Allotment Community in developing the new agreements has been a very beneficial experience and seeks to address the commitment to, where possible devolving responsibility and engendering a greater sense of ownership. I anticipate an increase in the uptake of agreements in 2016/17.

### Conservation and Repair Work to Bishops Palace and Llandaff Bell Tower

Cadw awarded two Scheduled Ancient Monument grants to the Council of  $\pounds 21,067.77$  and  $\pounds 20,049.83$  to implement conservation and repair work to the Bishops Palace and Llandaff Bell Tower respectively. This funding, along with  $\pounds 104,000$  of capital funding within the 2015/16 capital programme, will be used to repair cracked and collapsed masonry to stabilise vulnerable sections of both monuments and provide seating and interpretation within the Bishops Palace to help to restore the amenity value of the garden and understanding of the monument. The work will be undertaken during the three month period from October – December 2015 and is anticipated to be completed by Christmas, subject to weather conditions.

### Natural Resources Wales (NRW) Funding 2015/16

The Council has received two awards of funding from the NRW 2015/16 grants programme. A Joint Working Partnership award of £45,000 has been allocated for a range of small access, conservation, educational, biodiversity and environmental projects across Cardiff. These will be implemented by the Parks Service, Rights of Way Team and County Ecologist, working in association with Friends Groups and other organisations. A second Competitive Programme grant of £25,000 over three years has been allocated for the development of a volunteer hub at Forest Farm and will be used to develop the capacity of the Parks Service and Rights of Way Teams to support volunteer working throughout Cardiff as well as improving the infrastructure at Forest Farm.

### Alzheimer's Society

The Council's Parks Service, in partnership with the Alzheimer's Society UK is developing a project designed to provide support and therapy to individuals suffering from the disease and through the development, design and management of annual bedding displays. The project which is at an early planning stage demonstrates the Council's commitment to working with partners and supporting the Society in Leading the Fight against dementia.

### Horticultural Heritage Skills Scheme

As part of the City Operations Directorates People Programme the Parks Service has been successful in recruiting a Horticultural Trainee through the Horticultural Heritage Skills Scheme and for a period of fourteen months. This Bursary Scheme is funded by Heritage Lottery and is aimed at increasing the number of skilled Gardeners available to sectors through the provision of training programmes within Gardens of special heritage interest.

## Waste Changes

The Cabinet Member hoped that the weekly updates on the collection changes were helpful and evidences that the scheme is on track and progressing well. The collection changes are now in full flow; an additional 9754 households now have a bin service instead of a sack service; just over 16,000 households have settled into the new striped bag service well and the city wide exchange programme has now completed over 15,000 household bin exchanges. We have also seen a good increase in people requesting food caddies as they begin to recycle more.

Residents are signing up to the new reusable sack service which started on 7 September 2015 and they are starting to use the orange stickers on the green bags to reorder more bags.

This month we are welcoming back our student community with recycling packs (bags, liners and information) to encourage them to understand the need to recycle and present their waste correctly.

Work continues to yield results in the neighbourhood trial areas. The initial LEAMS (street cleanliness surveys) independently surveyed by Keep Wales Tidy have noted an improvement in our streets in just one quarter. We improved from 66% to 66.4% in just a few months.

This is a significant contribution to the Council's "One Planet Cardiff" strategy which aims to reduce the overall environmental footprint of the city.

The Cabinet Member responded to questions raised in relation to the Tidy Text; Education support for the new Waste Management scheme; recycling targets; and availability of green bags.

6. Community Development, Co-operatives & Social Enterprise Statement

### Ball in the Wall

Commuters, residents and visitors woke up to a surprise on the first day of Rugby World Cup 2015 as Cardiff's most iconic landmark became the centre of attention when a giant rugby ball appeared to have crashed into the side of Cardiff Castle.

The '*Ball in the Wall*' spectacular was created as part of a nationwide initiative funded by ER2015 to support the promotion of host cities and cause a stir in the Welsh Capital.

22

In fact it caused such a stir that coverage went global and reports featured in French, Irish, New Zealand and even Palestinian press outlets.

The images went viral across social media and soon selfie's of the ball were being shared and the 'Ball in the Wall' hashtag out-trended #RugbyWorldCup putting Cardiff well and truly on the world map!

The initiative was developed collaboratively by the authority's events team and Wild Creations, a local Cardiff company helping to further showcase the excellence of the Capital's creative sector.

### Fanzone

ER2015 have established fifteen Official Fanzones around the UK giving fans an opportunity to soak up the tournament atmosphere and join in the nationwide celebration of rugby.

On behalf of ER2015, the Councils Events Team working in partnership with Cardiff RFC have created a Fanzone at the Arms Park which is second-to-none, welcoming nearly 40,000 fans through turnstiles in the first weekend!

Not only can visitors watch live coverage of all matches across the tournament on a 40m sq. screen; they are also being treated to live entertainment including street theatre performers, DJs and music, S4C Regional Choirs, a Haka Day Out and Fijian Fire Eating.

They can also take part in sponsor activations and rugby activities such as a Kicking Cage, 3D Scrum, Batak Response Test and Speed Pass.

Again, media headlines and reports have been outstanding, proving that the Fanzone is a hit with supporters. The coverage has featured amazing quotes from visitors like Brian Swane - an Irishman from Cork, now living in London.

It was reported that he was completely smitten with Cardiff, and the Fanzone in particular saying, "Cardiff is amazing," he said. "It's the best city in the world to watch rugby and the best stadium in the world to watch rugby. The Fanzone has been brilliant today. I love that there is something for everybody. I know officially it's an England World Cup but it's a Welsh World Cup as well."

Source: Wales Online <u>http://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/the-best-city-world-watch-10096341</u>

### Time Credit Launch

The Cabinet Member was delighted to highlight the recent launch of the first UK citywide Time Credit scheme in City Hall on 10<sup>th</sup> September. The new scheme is being branded as "*Strengthening Cardiff Together; One hour at a time*" and is about rewarding individuals for every hour of their time they give to supporting local services or community activities.

As many of you will know, over the last three years the presence of time credits has grown in Cardiff as it has been taken on by a range of different organisations. However, this new scheme means that time credits are now being extended throughout the Families First programme and the City of Cardiff Council's Youth Service, so that time credits can be accessed by individuals and communities right across Cardiff, not just in certain areas.

As the Elected Member for the Caerau ward, the Cabinet Member explained how he had seen first-hand the difference time-credits can make to our communities through the work that Communities First have been doing with Spice in this area. Working in partnership with organisations such as Communities First, Families First, Dimensions, Age Connects, The Sherman, the Youth Service and residents from communities like Tongwynlais can bring services closer to people and give areas the opportunity to shape the services they receive. The Cabinet Member strongly encourage everyone to think about how this new scheme can be used in their areas and be part of this innovative approach, and bring change with tie credits to Cardiff.

## 78 : ORAL QUESTIONS

### Question: County Councillor Woodman

Will you give a firm commitment now to host the football exhibition which was removed from Central Library of Jewish, Christian, and Muslim football players playing football captured in a series of photographs as soon as possible in a building owned by Cardiff Council, please?

Having seen the exhibition, there is no offensive content, and indeed I have received no criticism whatsoever that the photos are offensive in content. If Cardiff Council hosts the exhibition in the coming few weeks, it will go a very long way in reestablishing Cardiff as a city that embraces sport, embraces all faiths, embraces all cultures and all communities, and will build bridges with the Jewish community who reside here and elsewhere.

### Reply: County Councillor Bradbury

I hope that my responses to the previous written questions on this issue have made my position clear, as well as my response I gave earlier to the public question.

I think it is essential that a proper process is in place that will ensure that Officers can make fully informed decisions on the appropriate use of Council's public space in line with our duties to promote good community relations.

Therefore, I have asked officers to undertake a review, which you are aware of, to establish such a process precisely because I want to avoid any future community concerns such as the one you describe in your question. I am not going to pre-empt this process.

## Supplementary question: County Councillor Woodman

The peace process in Northern Ireland began with Catholics and Protestants working together – actually, a group of women.

In your response, you do not give me a timeframe for your review. So when do you envisage completing this review, please? And, upon completion, will you then reconsider my question to you today? And, as she's left the chamber, would you please speak to Councillor Lent, because I am being bombarded with emails from people who contacted her – and she hasn't replied – in relation to this exhibition being removed?

### Reply: County Councillor Bradbury

I cannot speak for my colleague, Councillor Lent, but I will mention that you've raised this in the chamber.

I'm reluctant to put a direct timescale on this due to the fact that I want to make sure that the review is thorough and I don't want to rush it. However, the Chief Executive and the Director of Community and Housing are here. They are carrying out the review on my behalf and I will make sure – and we've had comments on this already – that they keep not just yourself, but all party leaders and all groups informed of the result.

It is an operational decision. Exhibitions in the Central Library are operational decisions, and that should stay the case, because there should not be political interference in what Officers deem appropriate after this review is carried out.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Darren Williams

Do you recognise that the concerns that were raised about the exhibition were not to do with the content to which Councillor Woodman refers in her question, but to the feeling that the exhibition did not give a full and accurate depiction of the experience of football in Israel and Palestine, inasmuch as it did not reflect the fact that Palestinian footballers are frequently prevented from playing, from travelling to play in games, which is against UEFA and FIFA rules; that players are harassed and sometimes imprisoned; and their sporting facilities are being attacked?

In view of that, I hope that, if the contentious exhibition is restored, that it is balanced out by another exhibition that reflects reality from the Palestinian side?

### Reply: County Councillor Bradbury

You are asking me to pre-empt the review and I am not going to pre-empt the review and the process. I just refer you to the answers I have given earlier on.

Question: County Councillor Dianne Rees

The cost of the new smaller black bins is now  $\pounds$ 1.1m instead of the original estimate of  $\pounds$ 2.4m. While this is a welcome saving to the council tax payer, it does beg questions:

- How could the Council get it so wrong?
- How will the unexpected money be spent?

### Reply: County Councillor Bale

First of all, I'm glad to see you welcoming the fact that we've come in under budget on something such as this procurement.

You will have noticed that actually it was £2.7m that was provided in Capital budget, not £2.4m, as stated, to support this project.

And the changes were down to a number of factors, not least market testing and data modelling on the houses that were actually included in the final procurement exercise.

The final price was also the result of a robust procurement exercise. You will no doubt be aware as well of the system we introduced for home-to-school transport that saved the authority almost  $\pounds 600,000$  and this is another example of Council Officers looking at ways that we can bring procurement projects under budget, but this is only month four, so it may change as a position – I do need to reiterate that to Members.

In terms of your second point, I would say again that this was an allocation from the Council's capital programme, so any saving in terms of the budget allocation will result in less of a borrowing requirement for the authority.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Dianne Rees

Do we have the necessary experienced staff? Experienced in accounting and procurement? Because we got this significantly wrong in the first place.

One would hope that it wouldn't get that far again. And how many other projects have gone through without the smaller sum being negotiated?

That was a question which has been raised in the WAO report and also the Audit Committee report about procurement skills. So that's really what I wanted to get to.

Reply: County Councillor Bale

The example I gave earlier of the introduction of unique system I think shows that we have a procurement team that is up there among the very best in Wales.

I certainly think that our staff in this area are not staff that we should be raising concerns around. I think this is an area we can celebrate and we can actually welcome the fact that not only are we coming under budget from a market-driven procurement exercise, but that we also have a procurement team that won awards, actually, for the work that they've done.

We are absolutely committed to high-quality procurement. This is an example of where we've absolutely got it right and we need to be very thankful for that.

## Supplementary question: County Councillor Boyle

Of course it's welcome when something is delivered under budget. But when you set your budget at the start of the year, you also set your Council Tax. And £1m is 1% on Council Tax, so it is important that you get these sums right because you're also setting the amount of money that you're charging the residents of this city and they need to know that when you're setting your budgets and setting their Council Tax that you're doing it rigorously and accurately.

Of course we welcome that it has come in under budget but that should have been nailed down when you set the budget and when you set the Council tax, not subsequently.

## Reply: County Councillor Bale

I would reiterate to Members that this is an allocation from the capital programme – it is not a revenue expenditure, which is where we set our Council Tax rates from – so this was a budgeted programme in capital. We came under budget in this exercise. It's something that's still being monitored – we're still only in month four – but, as I say, it's something that Councillor Rees acknowledged is a good outcome in terms of the procurement exercise.

## Question: County Councillor Richard Cook

If there is a surplus above the target amount in the moving traffic offences and civil parking offences fines at the end of the financial year 2015/16 what do you propose to spend the surplus on?

Reply: County Councillor Patel

If a surplus is realised through penalty charge notices they can only be used in accordance with Section 55 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984.

The Act allows funding to be spent on the following:

- 1. The operation of, or facilities for, public passenger transport services.
- 2. Highway improvement projects in the local authority area.
- 3. Environmental improvement in the local authority area.

Currently, the strategy for any surplus is to expand the current provision of enforcement cameras, enforcement cars, and also to improve our on-street parking meters.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Richard Cook

Cardiff needs to move to a 50-50 modal split, which I've talked about enough. Will you commit to spending half of any surplus as is laid down by the law that you just said on environmental projects and highway projects, improving walking and cycling in this city?

I believe that those two things you suggested cover, for example, resurfacing pavements and creating cycle ways. I think it's only fair that we should spend 50% of the surplus on walking and cycling as well as vehicle movements. Will you commit to do that?

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

I'm not going to commit myself to a 50% spend because, as you appreciate, that is a decision for the Council – not my own decision. What I can commit is, as I said earlier on, some of those things we're doing.

As far as the environmental issues, we will be looking at, for example, tactile pavement on crossings; ramp access where there are disability issues; developing the public right of way network; and supporting projects such as Greener Grangetown, Rhiwbina flood alleviation scheme, and the bike-hire scheme.

## Supplementary question: County Councillor Howells

Thanks to funding that was secured by the Welsh Liberal Democrats, work on the Eastern Bay Link Road is about to start in November, with completion in February 2017.

Can consideration is given so that any surplus that you do have in the highway fund to devise schemes that encourage traffic to use this road and hence reduce congestion along Newport Road, particularly by the CRI in Adamsdown, which is heavily congested, and also schemes that discourage rat-running through Adamsdown and Splott, as happens at the moment.

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

Certainly, what we would be looking at is a city-wide approach. It wouldn't just be one particular area. It would be unfair of me to say we will look at Adamsdown, or somewhere like that, but what we will do is certainly look at a whole city-wide approach. And what I would welcome is certainly if you've got any of those concerns is drop me an email and we will put that into the system.

## Question: County Councillor Clark

The timetable for completion of the new Cardiff bus interchange was outlined in the 2 July 2015 Cabinet report. It said it was planned to:

- sign the lease with the BBC to release the current bus station land in October 2015
- present to Cabinet the bus station detailed scheme and costings in October 2015
- submit the planning application for the bus interchange in December 2015

However, I understand that the detailed scheme and funding approach will not be submitted until the November 2015 Cabinet meeting.

When do the Council anticipate the signing of the lease with the BBC to release the current bus station land? In addition, will the planning application for the new bus interchange still be submitted by December 2015?

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

The Council still anticipates the BBC signing an Agreement to Lease in October.

Site preparation works are due to commence at the old bus station site next week.

This will discharge pre-development planning conditions and enable the development to commence as soon as the BBC signs their lease.

It is anticipated that a report dealing with the detailed scheme and costings will be brought forward consideration by Cabinet in November.

Since the last report to Cabinet in July, Network Rail has brought forward concept plans for the modernisation of Central Train Station and work has begun to join the two schemes up.

The intention now is to deal with the planning application for the new interchange building in two phases. The first phase will be submitted in December and will deal with the demolition of the NCP car park and excavating the site.

The second phase will deal with the detailed design for the new interchange building and will be submitted in April/May.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Clark

I am concerned that it sounds like the actual consideration of the costings, which were due to be in that initial October report will now be in November and the release of the Council land will be made before we've got any idea of the overall costings of the scheme.

What kind of reassurance can you give me that Members will have a chance to scrutinise the release of that land? Or can it not be brought forward – the actual costings for it?

Could you also clarify for me which committee or forum or individual at this council is actually going to make the decision to release that current bus station land for the BBC to build on – which was the forum that made that decision, please?

### Reply: County Councillor Patel

As you are well aware, as you are a member of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee, there has been a joint scrutiny between the environmental and economic scrutiny which have been looking at it. And I have always made that promise that it

would be, obviously anything to do with this development it would come through scrutiny.

The thing we have to remember is this article [front page of the South Wales Echo 22/09/2015] which was only a few days ago, clearly says "it's a £400m square deal. Legal & General agreement described "a huge vote of confidence"".

And I quote: - "The deal has been welcomed by UK chancellor George Osborne."He said: "Today we see a major vote of confidence in the Welsh economy with a new partnership between Legal & General and Rightacres.

"Laura Mason, director of direct Investment at Legal & General Capital, said: "Cardiff has been hugely successful in establishing itself as real player in the inward investment arena and Central Square represents the most exciting regeneration scheme due to come forward in Wales."

And the Echo comments are very simple and clear here:

"The massive nine-figure Central Square deal we report on today cannot be seen as anything but a massive vote of confidence in Cardiff. Cardiff is a city that is clearly going places."

That speaks volumes and is not negative towards this scheme.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Dianne Rees

I just wanted to say that I think we ought to congratulate here the Welsh Secretary for bringing investment into Cardiff as was evidenced by George Osborne's statement so I think we ought to congratulate him. The work done behind the scenes, particularly electrification in Wales has been tremendously successful in improving the economic attractiveness of Cardiff. Do you agree?

Reply: County Councillor Patel

No I don't. What I would like to do is congratulate the Leader and the First Minister for having the vision. So thank you very much.

### Question: County Councillor Cowan

The Council has revealed that the cost of replacement wheelie bins necessary to operate the new household waste collection arrangements was over-estimated by some £1.1 million.

Will the Cabinet member confirm that the over provision in the budget will now be allocated to finance the continued operation of the Wedal Road Recycling Centre in accordance with the stated wishes of the Cardiff public?

Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

The decision to reduce the number of household-waste-recycling facilities from four to two, which included the closing of the Wedal Road site, has already been taken as a Council decision in 2013/14 and reiterated in 2014/15. And I don't remember your objections at the time.

This decision was taken to save on the Council's revenue expenditure, not the capital expenditure. As an experienced Councillor, you will be aware that the Council cannot switch money between these two types of funding. A capital budget has already been provided to support the development of the new household-waste-recycling centre. The decision has not been based on capital allocations.

As indicated in the month four budget monitoring report to Cabinet, the projected  $\pounds$ 1.1 million underspend will be used to reduce the Council's borrowing requirement. The allocation is from the Council's capital programme and therefore cannot be used to support the revenue costs of the continued operation of the recycling centre.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Cowan

I ask you to put on record why you detracted from the proposals originally from Councillor Govier and then proposed your new proposals. I understand the cost was cost-neutral, whichever site you went for. So could you just explain the rationale behind the change from the Labour Cabinet from one Cabinet Member to the other?

### Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

Well, Councillor Govier's not here but I will explain. Councillor Govier at the time felt that there was only one option available to him. Following representations from a number of people, including local Councillors in the area, I asked Officers to explore the possibility of another site. Lamby Way came up as a very distinct possibility.

When we compared the two sites – Wedal Road and Lamby Way – it became very clear to me that Lamby Way was a much more suitable site. It's out of the way of residential... people, so it's not going to cause them the same problems. The traffic flow there is much easier and simpler to do. So, in terms of reality, it was a much better site.

And I just wanted to comment on your comment about the Cardiff public. I take it you're including in that overwhelming wish of the Cardiff public the residents of Wedal Road – are you – who have made it very clear to me that they don't want it to be in Wedal Road, and also the residents that use Lamby Way – you seem to be forgetting that Lamby Way is being used as well.

### Question: County Councillor Gordon

Riverside Ward residents welcome Ninian Park Road traffic calming and speed reduction measures and ask if there can be support for Wyndham Crescent and Romilly Crescent 20mph speed limit in view of their proximity to primary schools and being a main rush hour route to and from the city centre?

Reply: County Councillor Patel

The Council introduced a "signs only" 20mph limit in the Cathays area in March, 2014, as part of a two-year pilot project.

The 20mph speed limit project is being monitored at six-monthly intervals over this time period. Data is being compiled on vehicle speeds, journey times, and walking and cycling flows. The monitoring data will be fully assessed and compared to the baseline data recorded prior to the introduction of the 20mph limit to give an indication of the impact of the 20mph limit on vehicle speeds.

This body of evidence will, once analysed, enable the Council to consider whether or not to introduce 20mph limits more widely across the city. Requests for additional 20mph limits are being recorded and will be considered following the evaluation of the pilot.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Gordon

There's so much pressure and so many more cars and there seems to be an attitude amongst people in cars that as long as they're in their car, they're safe and they don't care about people on foot. And Windham Crescent is actually goes past St Mary's Primary School.

Surely, two years is rather a long time to run a pilot. Can't you possibly bring it forward so that we can have 20mph zones in other areas of the city?

### Reply: County Councillor Patel

One of the exercises that we are carrying out – which I remember having a discussion with you – is certainly to look at the pilot in advance. That's why there's six-monthly investigations going on. So, obviously, if we have a pattern which clearly says that this is progressing well then, obviously, I will have to review that pilot hopefully a bit earlier.

At this moment in time I can't say that. But what I can say is there are other schemes which we do look at. Which is like, say, for routes to schools. Unfortunately, a bid was submitted for safer routes in community funding for financial year 2014/15 for the creation of school safety zone outside St Mary's Roman Catholic Primary School in Windham Crescent in Riverside.

Unfortunately, funding was not awarded for this scheme. But that does not mean it just stops there – we will continue to look at these schemes and we will continue to monitor the traffic in that area.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor McKerlich

Can you suggest to Councillor Gordon that she should not be greedy and that, in the run-up to a Riverside election, it would be absolutely shameless for you to offer this bribe to the people of Riverside? So for that very good reason, you will tell her that all available funds will be channelled instead to the much needier environment of Radyr and Morganstown.

## Reply: County Councillor Patel

Councillor Gordon has been very active in this for many years and I can clearly recall Councillor Gordon coming to contact me over a year ago, well before any by-election. So she has been campaigning on this issue for a long, long time. I welcome any Member who actually fights for their wards and campaigns for it, and equally the same, Councillor McKerlich, when you had issues in your ward I was out there with you to look into those issues. So I'll do that with any other Members.

## Question: County Councillor Carter

What steps is this council going to take to mitigate the risks of increased fly tipping as a result of the new smaller bins?

## Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

Comparisons have shown that fly tipping may not necessarily increase with restricting waste bins, so we shouldn't be scaremongering on this. You may recall I've answered Councillor McEvoy in the past, who created the same sort of question to me. However, we have planned for all scenarios and additional Enforcement Officers are in place, as I mentioned to Councillor Thomas, to tackle any of the waste presentation issues or flytipping of waste.

The teams are working hard to ensure residents make full use of the recycling and support services available to them, as well as tackle those that present black bags incorrectly.

## Supplementary question: County Councillor Carter

I think it's disingenuous to talk about scaremongering. This is a real threat to wards such as my own, which is full of woods, across Pentwyn and Llanedeyrn.

Thank you for those assurances and additional Enforcement Officers and, obviously, your hope and faith that it isn't going to be a problem.

But, having said that, if it fails and if your actions do fail, would you make a commitment to this Council chamber that you would reconsider your own position and possibly do the honourable thing and resign if you come back in a year's time and find that this foolish scheme of yours has actually plunged my ward into the depths of rubbish and litter?

## Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

You accuse me of scaremongering and then tell me l've issued a foolish scheme. I seem to you remember your own party rolling out bins previously. This is not a new thing. If you look elsewhere, everybody else is doing the same sort of thing.

This is a way to increase recycling. Would you rather me sit on my hands and do nothing and therefore not have the problems that you're alluding to and ending up with failing to meet our recycling targets and getting a fine of a couple of million pounds a year? That's not the way forward for me. I think we have to make positive

action. I'm prepared to take positive action, even if at times it can prove a bit unpopular.

What I have said to you is that we are producing the Enforcement Officers – an extra 18 people are temporarily in place – to actually deal with those sorts of issues. They will remain in place until I feel comfortable that we have addressed all the issues concerned.

I can't give you a cast-iron guarantee that fly tipping won't increase at all. What I can say is that the intention is to make sure that it doesn't increase. But we have to deal with it as it comes.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Graham Thomas

I stand to support Councillor Carter's question because I do think fly tipping is likely to increase as a result of these measures and, indeed, we've already seen fly tipping increase as a result of the recycling centres.

Will consider taking targeted action in wards such as mine, which are distant from recycling centres now, such as public-access skips, which may have a rota of every two months, etc. and therefore would help alleviate the problems.

### Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

I have said on a number of occasions in the past, on the record and for all to hear, and I repeat it again - fly tipping did not increase as a result of Waungron Road being closed.

## Question: County Councillor Graham Thomas

What is the Cabinet Member's response to the recent employee survey results which did not show the Council in a good light in terms of being a good employer. For example, less than a third of our employees felt that their health and wellbeing was important to the Council.

### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

The response- and I know we've covered a little bit of this earlier on, but I take the opportunity to build on it.

The response to this year's Employee Survey was the best we ever had, with 51.6% of employees responding from the 6,315 people in scope.

That's additional 1,211 people have responded compared to 2013, an increase of 59%. This shows a healthy level of employee participation for an organisation dealing with and responding to continuing financial challenges.

The increase in responses can be attributed to the consolidated programme of engagement. Activities undertaken:

- Employee Road shows
- The Ambassador Network and workshop activity

- The Chief Executive himself Have your Say sessions
- Directorate-led Activity
- Cabinet Member Visits

There has also been a significant increase in the number of respondents to the Employee Survey compared to previous years, particularly, in traditionally hard to reach areas. For example roadshows at Lamby Way and the Cardiff Manager Programme.

In particular, there is a question around health and wellbeing. This is a new question that has [not] been asked before and is part of the refreshed approach to the Survey that is aligned to key strategic priorities as set out in the Workforce Strategy and Employee Charter.

The Council is developing a health-and-wellbeing strategy, which Cabinet will consider in the Autumn. An employee-assistance programme; the Welsh Government's Time to Change programme, which is addressing some of the mental health issues; and certainly the joint partnership board and working with some of the trade unions are all specifics that have improved in the last 18 months.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Graham Thomas

I agree there are some positive reports in this survey and I think that is to be welcomed.

I wasn't actually going to stand up and ask a supplementary because Councillor Cowan's already asked this question twice. But, seeing as we haven't actually had an answer, I think I'll ask it again.

Question 5, which says that the greater segment of responses to this survey don't think that they would recommend Cardiff Council to a friend as an employer. Despite, obviously, face-to-face conversations that you have had with staff, how do you respond to the figures in the report?

Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Well needless to say, Councillor Thomas, I'm not going to change my answer.]

All those figures within that report – and let's see the full report that will be scrutinised at PRAP next week – are absolutely 100% behind our staff. And I think some of the things we've been doing – the actual response rate is probably the best in the UK. This organisation has gone full out to engage staff, to support staff, to develop staff, to take on some of those challenges.

Now 370 middle managers have gone through a programme that never existed before. Four modules addressing change, financial awareness, many of the issues that are facing our challenges.

Now what we can't keep doing in this chamber is running our staff down. We should be supporting the good, hard working staff that want to be developed, are being developed. And I would ask Members of this chamber not to start pouring scorn on

some of the things that are happening around this chamber that we should be absolutely stood behind. I would ask Members to restrict that and get behind staff and not just pick out the worst score, which you have done, Councillor Thomas – the worst score – which are all above the mean, all above five, good or better.

### Question: County Councillor Gordon

Is it possible to combine raising awareness of collection service and availability of Education/Officer visits with measures with stronger targeted action on those who dump and litter?

Also can you remind people that they can report problems and have them dealt with?

Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

We have additional staff in place to provide education and support to residents, as I've already earlier mentioned, but they also are there to obviously target those that may incorrectly present waste. Each day of the week, these Officers are targeting residents that present black bags on the wrong day or put them in the wrong places.

To date, 3129 notices but I'm pleased to say that only 81 fines have accrued since then because we're concentrating on the education side of it – that's the main thing. This work and the on-going positive communication activities about the changes will continue well into next year. So, yes, we will be reminding people about reporting issues and also how they can get assistance.

Our commitment to tackling incorrectly presented waste and littering remains.

Question: County Councillor Carter

I refer you back to my previous question: if it goes up, will you resign?

Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

No.

Question: County Councillor Howells

At a meeting of the Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee on 10<sup>th</sup> September 2015, it was reported that a number of the Council's sports halls, including the one at the STAR Centre, were operating at 100% usage.

With no sports hall being provided at the STAR Hub in Tremorfa, how does the Council propose to address the deficit in sports provision in the STAR area when the STAR Centre is closed?

Reply: County Councillor Bradbury

As Councillor Howells should be aware, we have been working for some time now on trying to provide an alternative in the area to compensate for any deficit in sports provision. While there will be space within the new hub for certain activities, I have

been discussing with my Cabinet colleague for Education, Councillor Merry, about whether there could be any community access to the sports hall at Willows High School. The sports hall – "The Barn" I think it's called locally – is currently the subject of a refurbishment tender and I will be happy to provide further information to local Members in due course.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Howells

The report that we had before Economy and Culture was very revealing but it wasn't a surprise. 100% usage just shows how popular that sports hall is, as did the petition that Councillor Marshall presented earlier. So the residents are quite within their rights to wonder why a sports hall wasn't provided as part of the STAR Hub.

So can I ask that all local Members for the STAR area are kept abreast of developments at Willows and, if a scheme at Willows can't be delivered, can you please give serious consideration to adding a sports hall to the STAR hub? I think it's the least our residents deserve.

### Reply: County Councillor Bradbury

I can't make assurances on point two but on point one I certainly can make assurances.

I'm committed to trying to find a sports hall – or substitute for a sports hall in the area – simply because, as you've said, there is high usage there and it's something that, from the start of this project, I've been committed to finding a solution. I think we may be there with Willows, but I don't want to pre-empt further conversations we have with the school and Councillor Merry.

### Supplementary question: County Councillor Huw Thomas

You will be aware that local Members for Splott first aired the idea of using the hall at Willows with you over a year ago now. I am pleased that some progress has been made working with the school and, indeed, I understand the school are very excited about the idea of opening the facility up to the community, which they see as being vital to bringing the community into the school.

There have been some teething issues with procurement and with getting initial work to set it out, which Councillor Merry's been supportive with, but I ask can you do everything within the power of your offices to move the procurement process along?

## Reply: County Councillor Bradbury

Absolutely. I've been a strong advocate for this scheme. I think it's a good way forward for both the school and the community. Anything I can do to help solve those teething problems, I'm more than happy to. And, on Councillor Howells' earlier point about meeting with Members across the STAR community, I'm always happy to take difficult meetings and I will be very happy to meet with all of you on what should be a relatively simple thing, hopefully – hopefully – touch wood [touches wood].

## Question: County Councillor Cowan

Figures released by the Data Unit Wales confirm what Councillors and members of the public have known for sometime – that Cardiff Council is the worst performing Council in Wales and that the performance indicators suggest that the situation has got worse since the present Cabinet took control.

Why are Cardiff residents and the Council's service users having to pay the price for inexperienced councillors purporting to run our City and failing miserably?

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

It is no secret that this Council has faced historic and long-standing performance issues. This was clearly spelled out in the Wales Audit Office corporate assessment last May.

This Administration is responding. We have placed a strong emphasis on performance management and of creating a culture of accountability and responsibility at every level.

This is beginning to have an impact. The WAO have acknowledged a "step change" in our improvement and planning arrangements. And though much remains to be done, indicators show that this administration has made great progress in turning around a major statutory service like Education over the last two years.

I would also warn against a crude and simplistic interpretation of these scores. Understanding performance requires that we all adopt a much more nuanced approach. For example, when Social Services measures are discounted, 70% of the indicators are improving.

We recognise that performance challenges remain in Social Services, and we are working hard to address these. Though I would say again, this is a nuanced picture, with the regulator reporting a "good direction of travel."

The Wales Audit Office visit in October will give a clearer picture of the rate of improvement in the Council. But I believe we are an improving Council, one which now has the self awareness to know where it is good and where it is weak, and the ability to act tackle poor performance in a very robust manner.

# Supplementary question: County Councillor Cowan

Councillor Hinchey tonight you, I have to say, have been trying to justify what is just very basic, stark facts. You can't get any lower than 22 out of 22. We are the bottom – we are the worst in Wales. That is a fact.

So what responsibility does this Cabinet take for this shocking statistic and are we going to be in the same position next year when the results are published?

Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

It is a very simplistic view to take. Cardiff is in a unique position. We are the biggest employer in Wales, with 14,500 people in our organisation, with unique problems and unique pressures. If you compare us to some of those local authorities across Wales and you look at those scores, you will find that in the top ten you will find the rural authorities – different pressures than there are in Cardiff.

People in Cardiff understand that we are a growing city. The population here is over a tenth of what it is in Wales and we have increased pressures. For example, the Council would not attach the same sort of weighting as it would do in educational attainment that it would do to fly tipping. We have, absolutely, looked at these indicators and given our feedback. And I think that the Welsh Government will end up changing some of those indicators to reflect the differences and the priorities that this Council actually faces.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Ben Thomas

I refer to the question by Councillor Cowan - would you agree with me that these so called "inexperienced Councillors" would be directed from those Councillors on opposition benches who may switch from political views and parties midterm without the electorate knowing it and when one Councillor stands in an election in the guise of an independent views, they've failed the people who elected them miserably?

Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

In terms of whether Councillor Cowan sees the current Cabinet as experienced or not, I look around and I find the number of Cabinet Members next to me, in front of me with more then ten years' experience probably much more than yourself. The one difference is, Jayne, that you haven't had that experience at the top because Cardiff don't want you in charge of Cardiff.

Question: County Councillor Ali

What are the expected economic benefits to the city by hosting the Rugby World Cup 2015 matches?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

The economic benefit to Cardiff has been estimated at £316m, and that's based on the total number and spend of visitors, specific infrastructure investments, and also the share of centrally generated benefits from the tournament.

Rugby World Cup 2015's in 13 host venues, in 11 cities and Cardiff is proud to be hosting eight of the tournament matches.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Ali

What measures have you taken to reduce the rail and transport delays?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

Thank you for raising the issue of transport, Councillor Ali – it's certainly an issue I raised with the Secretary of State for Wales on the weekend and also with the Welsh Government Transport Minister earlier this week. I know the Chief Executive was meeting with the transport companies earlier today as well to make sure that the experience of people coming to and from the city for some of those matches is absolutely where it needs to be.

#### Supplementary question: County Councillor Woodman

I appreciate you won't be able to give the answer this evening but you might.

Could you tell me what were the economic benefits to the city in the recent Wales-Israel football match that was held here?

Reply: County Councillor Bale

I don't have the answer to hand, but I'm more than happy to make sure Officers will provide that to you.

Question: County Councillor Boyle

What lessons about the Council's procurement process have been learnt following the discovery that the cost for introducing new bins to the city will be around £1m less than expected?

Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

The initial capital bid requested for the bin exchange programme was £2.4 million. This was based on an initial estimate from the directorate.

In preparation for the tender exercise, more detailed market research was undertaken which identified a pre-tender estimate of £1.7m, which was below the initial Capital budget allocation. As a result of the competitive tendering process the Council was able to award a contract valued at £1.3m. Although this is £400,000 less than the pre-tender estimate, some of the tender submissions did match or exceed the pre-tender estimate.

Although the original estimate when the bid was made was in excess of market rates, the pre-tender estimates following the market soundings set for the bins was appropriate.

The procurement secured the best contract price by combining the elements into one and seeking a single supplier. This is a good news story on how well managed procurement can assist in keeping costs down.

Supplementary question: County Councillor Boyle

Earlier on today, we heard from the Chair of the Audit Committee, who spoke about certain concerns that he had about the awarding of contracts – those were his words.

He was concerned about some of the issues around the awarding of contracts. And I think he spoke specifically about some of the issues within schools.

And I think, actually, the Children and Young People Scrutiny – we did a task and finish recently into schools causing concern. We went to Whitchurch School, and Whitchurch certainly seemed to suggest that they were able to procure school buildings at a vastly lower price than – because they have a different governance structure – than other schools within the city. And it's something that perhaps as a committee we need to look back at.

So, really, I want to sort of broaden out from the bins issue and say whether you're confident about the way the Council as a whole procures and organises contracts, bearing in mind the concerns raised by the Chairman of the Audit Committee earlier on and some of the things we saw as a committee at Whitchurch School as well.

Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

Absolutely, I would certainly say there are lessons always there to be learned and certainly there will be some made from this.

The market value actually decreased over that period. I think the answer I gave you told you that there is a time lapse in all business, as I'm sure people across the chamber have some experience of running big businesses. But such a big procurement exercise takes some time. Of course, in local government, we have to go through a much longer winded procurement exercise because of the regulations, etc. So that time lapse obviously increases or decreases the market value.

We didn't need as many bins as we first anticipated and, of course, estimating and putting money aside compared to when you actually go to the market – as I said, some of the tenders actually came in to the figures that we thought. But we took the best value for this organisation. And, again, I just say this is a good news story as opposed to a bad news story. It just shows the better light of procurement.

Question: County Councillor McKerlich

Will the green bin collection empty as many green bins as residents put out or is the advised limit of two still applicable?

Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

The April Cabinet papers clearly stated that the new limit will be set at two wheeled bins per household for green waste. Existing arrangement where residents have more than two green bins are being reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Green waste recycling is important to us, but reducing our costs, delivering efficient services, and preventing waste in the first place is a greater priority. We need to encourage people to home compost (which is reasonable for people with large gardens that may require the above-average allowances of green wheeled bins) or make use of the household waste recycling centres.

#### Supplementary question: County Councillor McKerlich

I understand the confusion in the response that initially it was going to be set at two bins but now it's on a case-by-case basis but let me just take you through the situation. When we had details of recycling rates by ward, the best performing one was Lisvane, which was at around 70%, which compared with the worst performing one, which was round about 16% of the waste being put out was capable of being recycled. That's a big difference – 16% compared to 70%. But Lisvane had 43% of its 70% which was green waste.

Now I can understand the point you're making, and it's a good point, that if you persuade people to compost at home, it will reduce your costs on processing and collecting probably by around £30 a tonne. But the downside is that, if you persuade people to compost at home, you have not the least chance of achieving a 70% recycling rate, which just supports the argument I've made to you so many times before – 70% is not only unattainable, it's idiotic.

#### Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

I think what we've got to bare in mind is a lot of people take the view that we shouldn't be collecting any green waste at all. Some councils actually charge for taking green waste away because most people should be composting at home. I certainly compost a lot at home and we also still put out green bins. But the point is that, whilst areas like Lisvane actually do recycle a lot, they also produce a lot more waste, so they've got a lot more work to do even in places like Lisvane.

My view is we need to be recycling more of the stuff that actually is more difficult. The green waste is actually something that people should be doing in their own home.

I'm not going to comment on the 70% target being ridiculous in your view because you've already told me in Lisvane they're already producing 70% and I think they can do better. So you've actually answered your own question.

#### Supplementary question: County Councillor Kelloway

Why do the waste-collection schedules delivered by post recently not give details of the dates when green bins will be collected under the winter arrangements?

#### Reply: County Councillor Derbyshire

We haven't finally decided when we're going to start. What I've said to Officers is that, following previous experiences, I just want to have a better view of when the leaf fall needs to be collected and I'm hoping that we might be able to carry on collecting fortnightly for a little bit longer. But the question is whether we can afford to do it given the budgetary constraints we've got. So that's probably the reason it's not gone out yet.

## Question: County Councillor Bridges

When members of the public (and councillors) report basic problems such as potholes and fly-tipping via Twitter to @cardiffcouncil, why are they often then told

submit the information again through the council's website? If they have provided sufficient information in their tweet for the problem to be rectified, should that not be enough? Will you agree to look into how these enquiries are handled in future?

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

These reports we receive via Twitter are extremely helpful, Councillor Bridges – and we do our best to answer them directly where possible – but they often lack all of the information that's required to provide the service.

To ensure that these requests are properly tracked and get to the right team as quickly as possible we do normally ask for customers to complete an online form.

These days, with the growth of social media, people increasingly expect to be able to contact their local authority via channels such as Twitter rather than writing letters or waiting on the phone.

That's why as part of the development of our customer-relationship-management system, we're reviewing our channels – like Twitter – can be used in a customer-services context and are developing this as a new platform.

As usual, I am ready to explore any suggestions that can improve the way we deliver services, and I would certainly welcome and be happy to meet with yourself to discuss any ideas.

## Supplementary question: County Councillor Bridges

I'm not really quibbling about those reports where further information is required but if someone says "this is a photo of a pothole outside number one Whitchurch Road," that surely gives the Council enough information to address the problem without needing to request them to fill out a form.

It's really just a question about whether we could be just a little bit more responsible and flexible with the approach we take to these things and whether perhaps it would be timely to review the way the Council deals with those sorts of enquiries to see if we can respond to residents' enquiries in the most efficient way for both the Council and the residents themselves.

## Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

We certainly can, and I'm sure that I'm more than happy to sit down and talk with you about any ideas you've got or your party.

I think we need just a couple of facts really. 45,000 people are now following Cardiff online and you will see that we are in the top ten best local authorities at responding to residents. Even our friends in Wales Online have quoted as "getting it right" with one in 13 residents following us on Twitter.

But, needless to say, I think the most important thing is that we are sometimes get a bit lazy when we've got all the information and the tablets and everything around us –

what's worse is if somebody comes out to fill a pothole, as you've described, and they don't have enough information then that resource can be very much ineffectively used.

What we also do in the CRM is replicate some of the information for future use. So a joined-up way of looking at people responding, some information coming in will build the database on what's happening and where on the streets, lamps, potholes, etc.

So full information is really, really important when people come through and you don't always get that via Twitter but, absolutely, I think it's something we're working on -a platform that we could work on.

#### Supplementary question: County Councillor Knight

I do share some of Councillor Bridges' queries on this. It's something I've mentioned quite a few times when I was on the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee. Certainly in terms of some of the anonymous profiles should feel that they would be able to report waste and other issues via Twitter and that will get resolved.

But I have seen recently that some of those things have been resolved online via Twitter without the forms. So I wonder if we would be able to ensure a consistent approach to this.

And also on the website form, I believe there are extra fields which aren't really necessary – a bit of a barrier to submitting this and even for our local ward in Cathays Labour website, we created our own form to make this a lot easier and asking far fewer details about the person who's submitting the details and making it easier for people to actually report waste and I was hoping you could do the same for the Council website.

#### Reply: County Councillor Hinchey

I'm actually working with Councillor Knight on some systems improvements and how we can work together to join up some of these systems and make the best use of customers' feedback.

As far as we're concerned, obviously, there has to be other things we as a local authority take into account. Things like confidentiality and social media, people using different names and the like. So those kinds of things absolutely will be part of the project as we work forward. But, most importantly, we want people to self help, we want people to be able to use tablets and phones and cut down the cost.

So I welcome that and, obviously, one of the main thrusts of this authority is to use mobile working and document storing and all that kind of thing, which I'm sure you'll be helping us with that.

## 79 : URGENT BUSINESS

There was no urgent business.

#### 80 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

The Council was advised that the Local Authority Governor Panel had met on 17the September 2015 to make recommendations to Council for approval on Local Authority School Governors.

In proposing the recommendations Councillor Garry Hunt proposed that the nominations for Adamsdown Primary School and Stacey Primary School be referred back to the Panel for further consideration. This proposal was seconded by Councillor Merry.

RESOLVED - That the following appointments to Local Authority School Governors be approved: -

| School   | Ward       | <u>Start of</u><br>Vacancy       | <u>Re-</u><br>appointment<br>requested | Applications<br>received          | Council Approved<br>Recommendation<br>(Yes/No))                        |
|--|------------|----------------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|--|
| Cantonian<br>High School                       | Fairwater  | 25/07/20<br>15                   |  | Dr Angela<br>Jones-<br>Evans      | Yes  |
| Cathays High<br>School                         | Gabalfa    | 16/09/20<br>15                   | Mr Ken<br>Daniels                      |                                   | Yes  |
| St Illtyd's<br>Catholic High<br>School         | Rumney     | 26/07/20<br>14                   |  |                                   |  |
| Albany<br>Primary<br>School                    | Plasnewydd | 02/09/20<br>15                   |  |                                   | Deferred by<br>Panel until<br>October LA<br>Governors<br>Panel Meeting |
| Allensbank<br>Primary<br>School                | Gabalfa    | 19/08/20<br>15                   |  | Mr<br>Kolowole<br>Singh           | Yes  |
| All Saints C/W<br>Primary<br>School            | Pentwyn    | 25/07/20<br>15                   |  |                                   |  |
| Bryn Hafod<br>Primary<br>School                | Llanrumney | 21/04/20<br>15                   |  | Mr<br>Jonathan<br>(Josh)<br>Jones | Yes  |
| Creigiau<br>Primary<br>School x 2<br>vacancies | Creigiau   | 02/09/20<br>14<br>08/07/20<br>15 |  | Mrs<br>Amanda<br>Bouadana         | Yes  |
| Ely and  | Ely        | 23/06/20                         |  |                                   |  |

## **Existing LA Governor Vacancies**

| Caerau<br>Children's<br>Centre                   |            | 15                               |                                    |     |
|--|------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------------|-----|
| Gladstone<br>Primary<br>School                   | Cathays    | 24/07/20<br>15                   | Mr Mel<br>Lewis                    | Yes |
| Herbert<br>Thompson<br>Primary<br>School         | Ely        | 13/05/20<br>15                   |                                    |     |
| Kitchener<br>Primary<br>School                   | Riverside  | 04/07/20<br>15                   |                                    |     |
| Lansdowne<br>Primary<br>School                   | Canton     | 20/05/20<br>15                   | Mrs<br>Shashikal<br>a<br>Mansfield | Yes |
| Llysfaen<br>Primary<br>School                    | Lisvane    | 15/07/20<br>15                   | Mrs<br>Caroline<br>Du Cann         | Yes |
| Millbank<br>Primary<br>School                    | Caerau     | 10/12/20<br>13                   | Mrs Gill<br>James                  | Yes |
| Oakfield<br>Primary<br>School                    | Trowbridge | 04/03/20<br>15                   |                                    |     |
| Pencaerau<br>Primary<br>School                   | Caerau     | 23/09/20<br>14                   |                                    |     |
| Pentyrch<br>Primary<br>School – 2 x<br>vacancies | Pentyrch   | 08/12/20<br>14<br>07/07/20<br>14 | Mr Guy<br>Briffett                 | Yes |
| Rhiwbeina<br>Primary<br>School                   | Rhiwbina   | 02/09/20<br>15                   |                                    |     |
| Springwood<br>Primary<br>School                  | Pentwyn    | 31/08/20<br>15                   | Mr Derek<br>King                   | Yes |
| St John Lloyd<br>RC Primary<br>School            | Trowbridge | 30/01/20<br>13                   |                                    |     |
| Thornhill<br>Primary<br>School                   | Llanishen  | 22/06/20<br>15                   |                                    |     |
| Tremorfa<br>Nursery<br>School                    | Splott     | 19/09/20<br>14                   |                                    |     |

| 4 | 6 |
|---|---|
| 4 | 6 |

|  | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |  | - |                     |  |
|--|---------------------------------------|--|---|---------------------|--|
| Windsor Clive<br>Primary<br>School – 2 x<br>vacancies    | Ely                                   | 18/06/20<br>14<br>04/09/20<br>15                   |   | Mrs Meriel<br>Jones | Yes  |
| Ysgol Glan<br>Morfa                                      | Splott                                | 29/01/20<br>14                                     |   |                     |  |
| Ysgol<br>Gymraeg Bro<br>Eirwg                            | Llanrumney                            | 23/04/20<br>14                                     |   | Mr Shane<br>Andrews | Yes  |
| Ysgol<br>Gymraeg<br>Coed-Y-Gof –<br>2 x vacancies        | Fairwater                             | 10/02/20<br>14<br>03/09/20<br>15                   |   |                     |  |
| Ysgol<br>Gymraeg<br>Melin<br>Gruffydd – 3 x<br>vacancies | Whitchurch                            | 13/05/20<br>15<br>18/06/20<br>15<br>17/07/20<br>15 |   |                     |  |
| Ysgol Pencae   | Llandaff                              | 03/07/20<br>15                                     |   |                     |  |
| Ysgol Pen Y<br>Pil                                       | Trowbridge                            | 11/09/20<br>13                                     |   |                     |  |
| The Court<br>School                                      | Llanishen                             | 21/07/20<br>15                                     |   |                     | Deferred by<br>Panel until<br>October LA<br>Governors<br>Panel Meeting |

# **Future LA Governor Vacancies**

| School                               | Ward     | <u>Start of</u><br>Vacancy | <u>Re-</u><br>appointment<br>Requested | Applications<br>Received                   | <u>Council</u><br><u>Approved</u><br><u>Recommendati</u><br><u>on</u><br><u>(Yes/No)</u> |
|--------------------------------------|----------|----------------------------|--|--|--|
| Fitzalan High<br>School              | Canton   | 27/01/20<br>16             |  |  |  |
| Radyr<br>Comprehensiv<br>e School    | Radyr    | 27/01/20<br>16             | Mr<br>Jonathan<br>Bussy                |  | Yes  |
| Ysgol Gyfun<br>Gymraeg<br>Glantaf    | Llandaff | 09/01/20<br>16             |  |  |  |
| Birchgrove<br>Primary<br>School      | Heath    | 29/10/20<br>15             | Mr Peter<br>Hudson                     |  | Yes  |
| Howardian<br>Primary<br>School – 3 x | Penylan  | 01/10/20<br>15<br>01/10/20 |  | Cllr Joe Boyle<br>Cllr Sue Lent<br>Mr John | Yes<br>Yes<br>Yes  |

| <u>School</u>                                       | <u>Ward</u> | <u>Start of</u><br><u>Vacancy</u>                  | <u>Re-</u><br>appointment<br>Requested | <u>Applications</u><br><u>Received</u> | <u>Council</u><br><u>Approved</u><br><u>Recommendati</u><br><u>on</u><br>(Yes/No) |
|---|-------------|--|--|--|---|
| vacancies   |             | 15<br>01/10/20<br>15                               |  | Worrall                                |   |
| Marlborough<br>Primary<br>School                    | Penylan     | 23/09/20<br>15                                     |  | Mrs Lucie<br>Connors                   | Yes   |
| Peter Lea<br>Primary<br>School                      | Fairwater   | 23/09/20<br>15                                     |  |  |   |
| Pontprennau<br>Primary<br>School – 3 x<br>vacancies | Pontprennau | 01/10/20<br>15<br>01/10/20<br>15<br>01/10/20<br>15 |  |  | Deferred by<br>Panel until<br>October LA<br>Governors<br>Panel<br>Meeting         |
| Rhydypenau<br>Primary<br>School                     | Cyncoed     | 28/09/20<br>15                                     |  |  |   |
| Roath Park<br>Primary<br>School                     | Plasnewydd  | 25/01/20<br>16                                     | Mr Gareth<br>Brown                     |  | Yes   |
| Severn<br>Primary<br>School                         | Riverside   | 16/12/20<br>15                                     | Cllr Iona<br>Gordon                    |  | Yes   |
| St Monica's<br>C/W Primary<br>School                | Cathays     | 27/01/20<br>16                                     |  |  |   |
| Thornhill<br>Primary<br>School                      | Llanishen   | 29/10/20<br>15                                     | Mr Mike<br>Imperato                    |  | Yes   |
| Ysgol Mynydd<br>Bychan – 2 x<br>vacancies           | Gabalfa     | 16/12/20<br>15<br>25/01/20<br>16                   | Mr Paul<br>Jeffries                    |  | Yes   |
| Ysgol Pencae  | Llandaff    | 21/10/20<br>15                                     |  |  |   |
| Ysgol Pwll<br>Coch – 2 x<br>vacancies               | Canton      | 13<br>27/01/20<br>16<br>27/01/20<br>16             |  |  |   |
| Meadowbank<br>Special School                        | Llandaff    | 16/12/20<br>15                                     | Mrs<br>Rhiannon<br>Scott               |  | Yes   |
| Riverbank   | Caerau      | 20/10/20   | Ms Alana                               |  | Yes   |

| School         | <u>Ward</u> | <u>Start of</u><br><u>Vacancy</u> | <u>Re-</u><br>appointment<br><u>Requested</u> | <u>Applications</u><br><u>Received</u> | <u>Council</u><br><u>Approved</u><br><u>Recommendati</u><br><u>on</u><br>(Yes/No) |
|----------------|-------------|-----------------------------------|---|--|---|
| Special School |             | 15                                | Dallimore                                     |  |   |
| Woodlands      | Caerau      | 10/12/20                          |   |  |   |
| High School    |             | 15                                |   |  |   |

# Schools Referred back to the Local Governor Panel

| <u>School</u> | <u>Ward</u> | <u>Start of</u><br>Vacancy | Re-appointment<br>Requested | <u>Applications</u><br><u>Received</u> | <u>Council</u><br><u>Approved</u><br><u>Recommendati</u><br><u>on</u> |
|---------------|-------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|--|---|
|               |             |                            |                             |  | (Yes/No)  |
| Adamsdown     | Adamsdow    | 22/10/201                  | Mr Akhtar Ali               |  | Referred  |
| Primary       | n           | 5                          | Mr John Dixon               |  | back to the   |
| School – 2 x  |             | 29/10/201                  |                             |  | LA Governor   |
| vacancies     |             | 5                          |                             |  | Panel in  |
|               |             |                            |                             |  | October   |
| Stacey        | Adamsdow    | 29/10/201                  | Mr John Dixon               |  | Referred  |
| Primary       | n           | 5                          |                             |  | back to the   |
| School        |             |                            |                             |  | LA Governor   |
|               |             |                            |                             |  | Panel in  |
|               |             |                            |                             |  | October   |

# 81 : APPOINTMENT TO COMMITTEE VACANCIES, CHAIR OF ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE AND CARDIFF BUS BOARD

**RESOLVED** – That

# (i) the following nominations received to Committee vacancies be approved;

| <u>Committee</u>                 | Nominations received          |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Planning Committee               | -                             |
| Audit Committee                  | Councillor Bill Kelloway      |
| Corporate Parenting Committee    | -                             |
| Democratic Services Committee    | -                             |
| Local Authority Governor Panel   | Councillor Fenella Bowden     |
| Children & Young People Scrutiny | -                             |
| Community & Adult Services       | -                             |
| Scrutiny                         |                               |
| Economy & Culture Scrutiny       | -                             |
| Environmental Scrutiny           | Councillor Keith Jones        |
| Policy Review & Performance      | ** Councillor Eleanor Sanders |
| Scrutiny                         |                               |
| Bilingual Cardiff Working Group  | -                             |
| Works Council                    | Councillor Burfoot            |

| Health & Safety Advisory Group | Councillor Woodman _ |
|--------------------------------|----------------------|
| Glamorgan Archives Joint       | -                    |
| Committee                      |                      |

NOTE: \* Plaid Group given place to Independent Member \*\* Lib Dem Group given place to Independent Member

- (ii) to note the appointment by the Labour Group of Councillor Mitchell to Chair of Environmental Scrutiny Committee;
- (iii) approve the nomination of Councillor Robson to Cardiff Bus Board.

(Formal meeting closed at 9.05pm)

## 82 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

# <u>COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT, CO-OPERATIVES AND SOCIAL ENTERPRISE</u> (COUNCILLOR PETER BRADBURY)

## WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

Please can you provide an update on your (and your officers') discussions with St Joseph's Amateur Boxing Club to try and identify suitable alternative accommodation for them in the city?

## Reply

I can confirm that a meeting has taken place with officials from the club at their current clubhouse at the Mynachdy site. I was delighted to see at first hand the great work the club do in attracting young people from the area to take part in meaningful sport and physical activity. Gyms like this, in such areas are a valuable asset which I am very keen to support where possible.

It is my current understanding that Schools Service have no immediate plans to close the site as they will continue provide the Pupil Referral Unit here. I have informed the club of this but also suggested they continue to search for alternative property in the area in order for them to develop and secure themselves for the long term.

## WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

Will the Cabinet members for Equalities & Sport and the Diversity champion meet with members of the Jewish community to discuss the recent events in relation to the withdrawal of an exhibition at Central Library, and consult with all faith leaders in this city as to how protocols for acceptance and withdrawal of council premises bookings are dealt with?

## <u>Reply</u>

I have asked the Director of Communities, Housing and Customer services to urgently review our processes and to make recommendations to Cabinet to ensure

that this we learn from this very regrettable situation in relation to the exhibition at the central library.

As part of that process we are hoping to work with the Interfaith group of organisations in the city and have written to a number of faith leaders including of course the Jewish Board of Deputies to invite them to a meeting in the near future to discuss the initial findings of the review.

I fully expect that the recommendations coming from the review will provide a robust and comprehensive process to ensure that full consideration is given in the future to the community impacts of the acceptance or withdrawal of any exhibition or display.

## WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

How soon will a protocol be designed to determine how the council would deal with a booking of a council owned premises that Cabinet Members/officers/Councillors deem necessary to withdraw? Also , how soon will the council review the current policy as to how the council accept bookings for an exhibition/event to be held on council owned premises?

#### <u>Reply</u>

#### I refer you to the answer provided to Written Question 2 above WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR WOODMAN

Will the Diversity champion for Cardiff Council be involved in discussions to work up a protocol to determine how in the future , the council would deal with matters should it be deemed necessary to withdraw a council booking to hold an exhibition or event in a council owned premises .

## Reply

I refer you to the answer provided to Written Question 2 above

## CORPORATE SERVICES AND PERFORMANCE (COUNCILLOR GRAHAM HINCHEY)

The recently published report by the Local Government Data unit shows that overall when evidencing comparator improvement 2013/14 to 2014/15 across all 41 indicators, Cardiff had only shown improvement in 17 (page 2 graph and narrative) indicators, less than half of all indicators.

Of the remainder the majority are reported as having declined in their performance since the previous year. This places Cardiff at the foot of the 'improvement' table.

When setting out the various service improvement actions covered by these indicators over the last year, was this decline in performance anticipated, planned for or recognised? What remedial specific action is being taken to ensure this decline overall does not continue and the Welsh Audit Office visit in October as your press statement sought to assure the residents of Cardiff "....we are fully expecting the

WAO to find that further significant improvements have been made since its last visit in 2014....." will be their outcome statement.

Could you set out why you view "..the indicators published today have some use, overall these figures give a very simplistic view of the performance of the council " ( press statement attributed to Cllr. Hinchey)

#### Reply

Thank you for your question and the opportunity to address this issue.

It is no secret that this Council has faced historic and long standing performance issues. This was clearly spelled out in the Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment last May.

This administration is responding positively to the challenges it faces. We have put in place the structures and measures required to ensure that the Council understands its performance profile, and has a culture of accountability and responsibility at every level of the organisation. This has been progressed through:

- Challenge Forum bringing together senior Executive and Non-Executive members, senior officers, and external advisors to consider organisational challenges and the Council's response to these.
- Star Chambers quarterly meetings through which Cabinet Members and Senior Officers hold candid discussion on performance across budget management, people management and service delivery.
- Accelerated Improvement Groups Chaired by the Chief Executive to provide intensive challenge and support in Education, Children's Services and Health & Social Care, involving both service management teams and external advisors to provide informed challenge.
- Effective Personal Performance & Development Reviews The Council has secured a step change in this area, with over 90% of employees having agreed objectives, and twice yearly formal reviews.

These measures are beginning to have an impact. The WAO have acknowledged a *"step change"* in our Improvement Planning arrangements. And the NSIs and PAMs confirm a significant improvement in the underlying performing of Education over the last 2 years. Estyn also recognised progress in the most recent monitoring letter on education services for children and young people, noting that *"overall, there is an emerging culture of more rigorous performance management..."* 

I would therefore argue that while your analysis of the position in respect of our performance against the National Strategic Indicators (NSIs) and Public Accountability Measures (PAMs) sets is correct - and this does not make easy reading when looking at a raw comparison – these figures give a very simplistic view of the performance of the council.

Any league table produced from these figures would be superficial as it would not take into account the different priorities and demands faced by individual local authorities. For example, Cardiff clearly faces additional pressures in its role as the Capital City of Wales.

Furthermore, it is not credible to attach equal weighting to the performance indicators across the board. For example the Council would not attach the same weighting to the educational attainment of looked after children as it would to the percentage of fly tipping incidents cleared within five working days, and I doubt the public would either.

Indeed, the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee in their letter to me on 15 September accepted that "the annual media assessment of Local Authority performance is a crude mechanism and note there is some evidence of a possible move away from Performance Indicators by Welsh Government."

A more nuanced analysis of performance data is required if we are to have the selfawareness to understand our strengths and weaknesses and put in place the right responses to tackling poor performance.

For example, when Social Services measures are discounted, 70% of National Indicators have improved or been maintained.

And in Children's Services, for example, during 2014-15 the Directorate focussed on improving performance in relation to indicators that have the greatest significance for safe and effective practice concerning children.

This indicators were based on guidance agreed between the Association of Directors of Social Services (ADSS), the Care & Social Services Inspectorate, Wales (CSSIW) and the Welsh Local Government Association (WLGA) and sit outside of the NSI and PAM data sets.

Our annual outturn demonstrated overall improvement against these PIs, with some exceptions. Feedback provided by CSSIW's Regional Director on 19<sup>th</sup> August, acknowledged that although there is a mixed picture in terms of overall improvement, performance indicators evidence a good direction of travel.

We therefore recognise that performance challenges remain in Social Services, and we are working hard to address these. Again, I would say again, this is a far more nuanced picture than reading the media analysis or simply the headline KPIs would suggest.

I will also take this opportunity to highlight that the NSIs and PAMs data sets do not cover the complete range of services delivered by the Council. For a fuller picture of performance across all Council services we must look to our Corporate Plan, through which we as a Council have set out our priorities and the measures we will use to understand how we are performing.

The Wales Audit Office visit in October will give a clearer picture of the progress the Council is making. But I believe we are an improving Council, one which now has

the self-awareness to know where it is good and where it is underperforming, and the ability to act to tackle this in a robust fashion.

# TRANSPORT, PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY QUESTION (COUNCILLOR RAMESH PATEL)

# WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

What business case has been carried out as part of preparations for the Cardiff Metro project on the potential costs/benefits of a train station serving Mynachdy & Talybont? If no business case has been prepared, will you agree to ask officers to undertake this work?

## Reply

I can confirm that the Council has not carried out any work to assess the costs/benefits for a station to serve Mynachdy and Talybont. Any work of this type associated with the Cardiff Metro project would be for the Welsh Government's Metro team to undertake. As far as I am aware the Metro team is not looking to provide a station in this location, however I will ask officers to pass on your request to the Metro team.

## WRITTEN QUESTION FROM COUNTY COUNCILLOR BRIDGES

I am aware of several complaints of gridlock at UHW, with many people citing the changes to the Gabalfa Interchange as making the problem worse because motorists are now using the UHW site as a cut-through. What work has been carried out to assess the changes to traffic on the UHW site?

## <u>REPLY</u>

I can confirm that Council Officers have been assisting UHW staff and their appointed Transport Consultant with regard to the traffic movements through the hospital site. Surveys have been carried out by UHW and the results of those surveys will be shared with the Council in a meeting to take place in October.

There is a need to understand the full nature of traffic movements in and around the UHW site so that any decision that UHW decide to take with regard to controlling traffic flows can be managed in conjunction with the management of the adjacent highway networks.